

1           **BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP**  
2           David Boies (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
3           333 Main Street  
4           Armonk, NY 10504  
5           Tel: (914) 749-8200  
6           dboies@bsfllp.com  
7           Mark C. Mao, CA Bar No. 236165  
8           Beko Reblitz-Richardson, CA Bar No. 238027  
9           Erika Nyborg-Burch, CA Bar No. 342125  
10          44 Montgomery St., 41st Floor  
11          San Francisco, CA 94104  
12          Tel.: (415) 293-6800  
13          mmao@bsfllp.com  
14          brichardson@bsfllp.com  
15          enyborg-burch@bsfllp.com  
16          James Lee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
17          Rossana Baeza (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
18          100 SE 2nd St., 28th Floor  
19          Miami, FL 33131  
20          Tel.: (305) 539-8400  
21          jlee@bsfllp.com  
22          rbaeza@bsfllp.com  
23          Alison L. Anderson, CA Bar No. 275334  
24          725 S Figueroa St., 31<sup>st</sup> Floor  
25          Los Angeles, CA 90017  
26          Tel.: (213) 995-5270  
27          alanderson@bsfllp.com

18          *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

21          CHASOM BROWN, WILLIAM BYATT,  
22          JEREMY DAVIS, CHRISTOPHER  
23          CASTILLO, and MONIQUE TRUJILLO  
24          individually and on behalf of all similarly  
25          situated,

26                 Plaintiffs,  
27                 v.  
28                 GOOGLE LLC,  
29                 Defendant.

1           **SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.**  
2           Bill Carmody (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
3           Shawn J. Rabin (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
4           Steven M. Shepard (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
5           Alexander Frawley (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
6           1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
7           New York, NY 10019  
8           Tel.: (212) 336-8330  
9           bcarmody@susmangodfrey.com  
10          srabin@susmangodfrey.com  
11          sshepard@susmangodfrey.com  
12          afrawley@susmangodfrey.com  
13          Amanda K. Bonn, CA Bar No. 270891  
14          1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400  
15          Los Angeles, CA 90067  
16          Tel: (310) 789-3100  
17          abonn@susmangodfrey.com  
18          **MORGAN & MORGAN**  
19          John A. Yanchunis (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
20          Ryan J. McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
21          201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor  
22          Tampa, FL 33602  
23          Tel.: (813) 223-5505  
24          jyanchunis@forthepeople.com  
25          rmcgee@forthepeople.com  
26          Michael F. Ram, CA Bar No. 104805  
27          711 Van Ness Ave, Suite 500  
28          San Francisco, CA 94102  
29          Tel: (415) 358-6913  
30          mram@forthepeople.com

19          **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
20          **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

21          Case No.: 4:20-cv-03664-YGR-SVK

22          **PLAINTIFFS' RENEWED REQUEST TO**  
23          **DEPOSE GOOGLE CEO SUNDAR**  
24          **PICHAI**

25          Magistrate Judge: Hon. Susan van Keulen

Pursuant to the Court's orders (Dkt. 523, 602), Plaintiffs respectfully renew their request to depose Google CEO Sundar Pichai. As detailed below, the evidence here far exceeds all apex requirements, showing (1) Mr. Pichai has unique, superior, and personal knowledge about key issues in this case, including Google's perpetuation of known private browsing misconceptions, and (2) Plaintiffs exhausted less intrusive means of discovery for this information. Plaintiffs deposed over 20 former and current Google employees, including the recent deposition of Sabine Borsay, who wrote about critical decisions and statements by and to Mr. Pichai regarding Incognito. Google witnesses repeatedly testified that they had no recollection of what Mr. Pichai said, considered, or decided with respect to these key issues. Because of Mr. Pichai's extensive involvement, and Plaintiffs' inability to obtain relevant testimony from others, Plaintiffs respectfully request 3.5 hours for his deposition,<sup>1</sup> to take place at least 15 days before Plaintiffs' opposition to any summary judgment motion or start of trial, whichever comes first. Attached as **Exhibit 1** is the Declaration of Rossana Baeza with supporting documents, and attached as **Exhibit 2** is a proposed order.

Mr. Pichai's Unique, First-Hand & Superior Personal Knowledge & Involvement in Key Events & Decisions	Plaintiffs' Exhaustion of Less Intrusive Means to Obtain This Information Without Mr. Pichai's Deposition
<p><b>2015 [REDACTED] Regarding [REDACTED] Incognito</b> : A 2015 Google study called [REDACTED]</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Ex. A</p> <p>[REDACTED] <i>Id.</i> (emphasis added).<sup>2</sup></p> <p>This document indicates Mr. Pichai had knowledge in 2015 about [REDACTED]</p>	<p>Plaintiffs sought production (e.g., RFPs 27 (Ex. B), 169 (Ex. C)) but were unable to identify any produced copy of the [REDACTED]. Plaintiffs also deposed multiple lower-level Google employees about [REDACTED], but they were unable to provide information about [REDACTED]</p> <p>Ex. D, Borsay Tr. 205:13-17; Ex. E, Palmer Tr. 86:6-14; Ex. F, Felt Tr. 60:19-61:22.</p>

<sup>1</sup> With the exception of Ex. M, submitted documents reference Mr. Pichai either in the main text or in the metadata (showing Mr. Pichai received the document as part of one or more email distribution lists included in the emails). In Plaintiffs' last submission, Plaintiffs inadvertently did not include that metadata showing Mr. Pichai's involvement.

<sup>2</sup> All exhibit references in this submission are exhibits to the Declaration of Rossana Baeza.

1           **2016**  
2                          In 2016 emails, Google  
3                          employee Sabine Borsay [REDACTED]

4                          Ex. G. Ms. Borsay wrote [REDACTED]

5                          [REDACTED] *Id.*  
6                          A later email from Ms. Borsay to Google  
7                          employee Chris Palmer [REDACTED]

8                          [REDACTED]  
9                          Ex. H (emphasis added). Mr.  
10                         Palmer [REDACTED]

11                         [REDACTED]  
12                         Ex. I.  
13                         Ms. Borsay also wrote that Mr. Pichai was the  
14                         one who [REDACTED]

15                         [REDACTED]  
16                         Ex. J.  
17                         These emails establish that [REDACTED]

18                         [REDACTED]  
19                         **2019 Pichai &** [REDACTED] : In  
20                         March 2019, Mr. Pichai [REDACTED]

21                         [REDACTED]  
22                         Ex. L.<sup>3</sup> [REDACTED]

23                         [REDACTED]  
24                         <sup>3</sup> The [REDACTED] Ex. M. [REDACTED]

25                         Plaintiffs sought production (e.g., RFPs 33 (Ex.  
26                         B), 169 (Ex. C)) but have been unable to  
27                         identify any document revealing what  
28                         discussions Google employees [REDACTED]

None of the witnesses  
Plaintiffs deposed were able to provide that  
information. Ex. E, Palmer Tr. 113:23-114:4  
(testifying he [REDACTED]; Ex. F, Felt Tr.  
Felt Tr. 122:14-24 (testifying she [REDACTED]

Ex. D, Borsay Tr. 258:17-260:23. Incredibly, Ms. Borsay even  
testified [REDACTED]

*Id.*, Borsay Tr. 252:18-254:5,

[REDACTED] Ex. K, Calhoun Borsay Tr. 53:12-14.  
Like the other witnesses,

[REDACTED] Ex. D, Borsay Tr. 266:8-20, 262:3-  
11, 253:7-25 (testifying she [REDACTED]

Plaintiffs deposed lower-level employees about [REDACTED]

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Ex. N, and Ex. O. These documents establish [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] Ex. E, Palmer Tr. 187:7-189:7 During the <i>Calhoun</i> deposition of Chetna Bindra [REDACTED] Ex. R, <i>Calhoun</i> Bindra Tr. 218:11-15.
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	2019 Pichai & [REDACTED] In April 2019, Google employee AbdelKarim Mardini reported that [REDACTED] Ex. S. Mr. Mardini [REDACTED] [REDACTED] <i>Id.</i> (emphasis added). These documents establish that [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
19 20 21 22 23 24 25	2019 Pichai & Incognito : An April 2019 [REDACTED] Ex. U. This document shows [REDACTED] [REDACTED]. Ex. Q, Mardini Tr. 327:24-328:17. No deponents were able to provide any information regarding Mr. Pichai's [REDACTED]
26 27 28	2019 Pichai & Incognito : In July 2019, Google employees discussed [REDACTED] Plaintiffs also questioned Mr. Halavati about this document, and [REDACTED]

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	Ex. W, Halavati Tr. 99:11-100:2. Plaintiffs also questioned another Google employee who [REDACTED]  Ex. V. This document shows first-hand, superior knowledge by Mr. Pichai about [REDACTED]
2019 Pichai & Incognito [REDACTED] : An October 2019 [REDACTED]  Ex. Y. This document establishes Mr. Pichai has first-hand, superior knowledge about [REDACTED]	No deponent has been able to provide any insight into Mr. Pichai's [REDACTED]  Ex. Q, Mardini Tr. 371:5-373:5.
2021 Pichai & Incognito [REDACTED] In 2021, Ms. Twohill emailed Mr. Pichai [REDACTED]  Ex. Z.	During her deposition, Ms. Twohill [REDACTED]  Ex. T, Twohill Tr. 120:5-21 (testifying she [REDACTED]  131:17-19 (testifying she [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]  Ex. AA. In 2009, when Google employees discussed [REDACTED]  Ex. BB. Mr. Pichai [REDACTED]	Plaintiffs deposed Brian Rakowski, who [REDACTED]  Ex. DD, Rakowski Tr. 20:12-22:24. Mr. Rakowski— [REDACTED]

1 Ex. CC.

2 Rakowski Tr. 212:14-214:25.

Ex. DD,

The evidence here far exceeds what was deemed sufficient to depose CEOs in many other cases. *See, e.g., Wonderland Nurserygoods Co. v. Baby Trend, Inc.*, 514CV1153JWHSPX, 2022 WL 1601402, at \*3–4 (C.D. Cal. Jan. 7, 2022) (allowing 4-hour CEO deposition where party “made a plausible showing” that CEO “may have unique knowledge” even though “efforts to use less intrusive discovery methods could have been more thorough”); *In re Google Litig.*, No. C 08-03172 RMW PSG, 2011 WL 4985279, at \*2 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 19, 2011) (allowing deposition of former Google CEO Larry Page for three hours where party had shown he had “unique knowledge of facts that cannot be secured by other less intrusive means of discovery”); *Khan v. Boohoo.com USA, Inc.*, CV2003332GWJEMX, 2021 WL 3882969, at \*2–3 (C.D. Cal. July 28, 2021) (allowing 4-hour CEO deposition where emails showed CEO was “hands on” and had “direct involvement” in relevant decisions); *Finisar Corp. v. Nistica, Inc.*, No. 13-CV-03345-BLF(JSC), 2015 WL 3988132, at \*2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015) (allowing CEO deposition where no other deponents were “able to testify to the contents of [relevant] conversations”); *In re Apple iPhone Antitrust Litig.*, No. 11CV06714YGRTSH, 2021 WL 485709, at \*3 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 26, 2021) (allowing 7-hour CEO deposition because as CEO, he had “unique and non-repetitive” knowledge of Apple’s business model); *WebSideStory, Inc. v. NetRatings, Inc.*, No. 06CV408 WQH(AJB), 2007 WL 1120567, at \*3, \*5 (S.D. Cal. Apr. 6, 2007) (permitting deposition of CEO with “unique, relevant knowledge” after party completed only one deposition, which “would aid in developing and refining a line of questioning” for CEO deposition); *Opperman v. Path, Inc.*, No. 13-CV-00453-JST, 2015 WL 5852962, at \*2 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 8, 2015) (allowing CEO deposition where CEO “personally participated in” and also “appears” he “may have been involved” in relevant decisions). Google opposed the addition of more document custodians and depositions, and Google at this point should not be allowed to argue that Plaintiffs should have deposed others. Plaintiffs have done more than enough.

27 Dated: July 21, 2022

Respectfully submitted,

28

1 By: /s/ Beko Reblitz-Richardson  
2 Beko Reblitz-Richardson

3 **BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP**

4 David Boies (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
333 Main Street  
5 Armonk, NY 10504  
Tel: (914) 749-8200  
dboies@bsfllp.com

6 Mark C. Mao (CA Bar No. 236165)  
7 mmao@bsfllp.com  
Beko Reblitz-Richardson (CA Bar No. 238027)  
8 brichardson@bsfllp.com  
Erika Nyborg-Burch (CA Bar No. 342125)  
9 enyborg-burch@bsfllp.com  
44 Montgomery Street, 41<sup>st</sup> Floor  
10 San Francisco, CA 94104  
11 Tel.: (415) 293 6858  
12 Fax: (415) 999 9695

13 James Lee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
jlee@bsfllp.com  
14 Rossana Baeza (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
rbaeza@bsfllp.com  
15 100 SE 2nd Street, Suite 2800  
16 Miami, FL 33131  
17 Tel.: (305) 539-8400  
Fax: (305) 539-1307

18 Alison L. Anderson (CA Bar No. 275334)  
alanderson@bsfllp.com  
19 725 S. Figueroa Street, 31st Floor  
20 Los Angeles, CA 90017  
21 Tel.: (213) 629-9040

22 **SUSMAN GODFREY L.L.P.**

23 Bill Carmody (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Shawn J. Rabin (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
24 Steven M. Shepard (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Alexander Frawley (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
1301 Avenue of the Americas, 32<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
25 New York, NY 10019  
Tel.: (212) 336-8330  
26 bcarmody@susmangodfrey.com  
srabin@susmangodfrey.com  
sshepard@susmangodfrey.com

1 afrawley@susmangodfrey.com  
2

3 Amanda K. Bonn, CA Bar No. 270891  
4 1900 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400  
5 Los Angeles, CA 90067  
6 Tel: (310) 789-3100  
7 abonn@susmangodfrey.com  
8

9 **MORGAN & MORGAN**  
10

11 John A. Yanchunis (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
12 Ryan J. McGee (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
13 201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor  
14 Tampa, FL 33602  
15 Tel.: (813) 223-5505  
16 jyanchunis@forthepeople.com  
17 rmcgee@forthepeople.com  
18

19 Michael F. Ram, CA Bar No. 104805  
20 711 Van Ness Ave, Suite 500  
21 San Francisco, CA 94102  
22 Tel: (415) 358-6913  
23 mram@forthepeople.com  
24

25 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
26  
27  
28